

The *ars subtilior*

During the 14th century, a new style of polyphony developed in France. This new style, called *ars nova*, was characterized by a new system of rhythmic notation allowing the use of duple and triple division of note values, as well as complex syncopations. Around 1370, several composers in Avignon and southern France moved away from the style of the *ars nova* motet to develop a highly refined and intricate style distinguished by extremely complex rhythmic notation. The new trend soon spread into northern Italy, northern Spain, and as far as Cyprus. In his *Tractatus cantus mensurabilis*, Philippus de Caserta, one of the composers of the *ars nova* period, described that later style as an *artem magis subtiliter*, or a “more subtle art.”

Musicologist Ursula Günther was the first, in 1950, to use the term “*ars subtilior*” to refer that complex musical style, which is the term widely used by musicologists today.

Musicologists predating Ursula Günther used different terms to refer to the *ars subtilior*. Musicologist Willi Apel, for instance, talks about “mannered notation,” or “manneristic style.” Other authors just mention the extreme complexity of the “late *ars nova*,” with no specific reference to either “manneristic style” or *ars subtilior*. Once I had identified all sources directly related to the terms *ars subtilior* or “manneristic style,” I directed my research toward the main primary sources for the *ars subtilior*: the Chantilly and Modena manuscripts, as well as the Torino manuscript. I also searched sources on Philippus da Caserta, Johannes Ciconia, Matteo da Perugia, Solage, and other composers directly associated with the *ars subtilior*.

Most of the sources I found are grounded in historical research (they focus primarily on manuscripts and other primary sources). Other sources adopted a more analytical approach, with emphasis on the tonal language and formal organization of *ars subtilior* works.

References sources

- Cullin, Olivier. "Ars subtilior." In *Guide de la musique du Moyen-Age*. n.p.: Fayard, 1999.
- Duffin, Ross W., ed. "Ars subtilior." [Discography]. In *A Performers's Guide to Medieval Music*, 572. Early Music America Performer's Guides to Early Music. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2000.
- Hagopian, Viola L. *Italian ars nova Music: A Bibliographic Guide to Modern Editions and Related Literature*, 2nd ed. Berkeley, Los Angeles, and London: University of California Press, [1973].
- Hughes, Andrew. *Medieval Music: The Sixth Liberal Art*. Toronto Medieval Bibliographies, edited by John Leyerle, 4. Toronto, Buffalo, and London: University of Toronto Press, [1979].

Verified Sources

- Angles, Higinio. "Intercambio musical entre las casas reales de Aragon y de Navarra con la de los condes de Foix. El codice musical de Chantilly." In *Historia de la música medieval en Navarra*, 355-76. Pamplona: Editorial Aranzadi, 1970.
- Apel, Willi. "The Development of French Secular Music during the Fourteenth Century." *Musica disciplina* 27 (1973): 41- 59.
- . "The French Secular Music of the Late Fourteenth Century." *Acta musicologica* 18-19 (1946-1947): 17-29.
- . "Mannered Notation." In *The Notation of Polyphonic Music 900-1600*, 403-26. Cambridge, Massachusetts: The Mediaeval Academy of America, 1945.
- , ed. Introduction to *Ascribed Compositions*. Vol.1 of *French Secular Compositions of the Fourteenth Century*. Corpus mensurabilis musicae 53. n.p.: American Institute of Musicology, 1970.
- , ed. Introduction to *French Secular Music of the Late Fourteenth Century*. Edition of the literary texts by Robert W. Linker and Urban T. Holmes, Jr. With a foreword by Paul Hindemith. The Mediaeval Academy of America Publication No. 55. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Mediaeval Academy of America, 1950.

- Arlt, Wulf. "Der Tractatus figurarum—ein Beitrag zur Musiklehre der *ars subtilior*." *Schweizer Beiträge zur Musikwissenschaft* 1 (1972): 35-53.
- Berger, Christian. "Solages Ballade *Calextonne* und die Grenzen des Tonsystems." In *Modality in the Music of the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Centuries*, edited by Ursula Günther, Ludwig Finscher, and Jeffrey Dean, 75-91. Musicological Studies & Documents, edited by Ursula Günther, 49. [Neuhausen and Stuttgart]: American Institute of Musicology, Hänssler-Verlag, 1996.
- Böker-Heil, Norbert. "Ein Lieblingsmotiv der *ars subtilior*?" In *Festschrift Wolfgang Rehm zum 60. Geburtstag am 3. September 1989*, edited by Dietrich Berke and Harald Heckmann, 9-14. Kassel, Basel, London, and New York: Bärenreiter, [1989].
- Crocker, Richard L. "Expansion of Part Music 1300-1450." In *A History of Musical Style*, 106-53. New York, St. Louis, San Francisco, Toronto, London, and Sydney: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1966.
- Cross, Lucy E. "*Ars subtilior*." In *A Performer's Guide to Medieval Music*, edited by Ross W. Duffin, 228-34. Early Music America Performer's Guides to Early Music. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2000.
- Fallows, David. "The End of the *ars subtilior*." *Basler Jahrbuch für historische Musikpraxis* 20 (1996): 21-40.
- Fenwick Wilson, David. "Polyphonic Song in Fourteenth-Century France." In *Music of the Middle Ages: Style and Structure*, 344-50. New York: Schirmer Books, 1990.
- Greig, Donald. "*Ars subtilior* Repertory as Performance Palimpsest." *Early Music* 31 (May 2003): 196-209.
- Günther, Ursula. "Die Anwendung der Diminution in der Handschrift Chantilly 1047." *Archiv für Musikwissenschaft* 17 (1960): 1-21.
- . "Die *ars subtilior*." *Hamburg Jahrbuch für Musikwissenschaft* 11 (1991): 277-88.
- . "*Calextonne* von Solage—ein ungewöhnliches Werk." In *Modality in the Music of the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Centuries*, edited by Ursula Günther, Ludwig Finscher, and Jeffrey Dean, 65-74. Musicological Studies & Documents, edited by Ursula Günther, 49. [Neuhausen and Stuttgart]: American Institute of Musicology, Hänssler-Verlag, 1996.
- . "Datierbare Balladen des späten 14. Jahrhunderts, I." *Musica disciplina* 15 (1961): 39-61.
- . "Datierbare Balladen des späten 14. Jahrhunderts, II." *Musica disciplina* 16 (1962): 151-74.

- . “Das Ende der *ars nova*.” *Die Musikforschung* 16 (1963): 105-20.
- . “Ein Ballade auf Mathieu de Foix (Handschrift Chantilly).” *Musica disciplina* 19 (1965): 69-81.
- . “Fourteenth-Century Music with Their Texts Revealing Performance Practice.” In *Studies in the Performance of Late Medieval Music*, edited by Stanley Boorman, 253-70. Cambridge, London, New York, New Rochelle, Melbourne, and Sydney: Cambridge University Press, 1983.
- . “Der Gebrauch des *tempus perfectum diminutum* in der Handschrift Chantilly 1047.” *Archiv für Musikwissenschaft* 17 (1960): 277-97.
- . “Das Manuscript Modena, Biblioteca Estense, &M.5, 24 (*olim* lat. 568 = *Mod*).” *Musica disciplina* 24 (1970):17-67.
- . “Problems of Dating in *ars nova* and *ars subtilior*.” In *L’ars nova italiana del Trecento IV: Atti del 3 Congresso internazionale sul tema “La musica al tempo del Boccaccio e i suoi rapporti con la letteratura” (Siena - Certaldo 19-22 luglio 1975), sotto il patrocinio della Società Italiana di Musicologia*, edited by Agostino Ziino, 289-301. Certaldo: Centro di studi sull’ars nova italiana del Trecento, [1975].
- . “Sinnbezüge zwischen Text und Musik in *ars nova* und *ars subtilior*.” In *Musik und Text in der Mehrstimmigkeit des 14. und 15. Jahrhunderts*, edited by Ursula Günther and Ludwig Finscher, 229-68. Göttinger Musiwissenschaftliche Arbeiten 10. Kassel, Basel, and London: Bärenreiter, 1984.
- . “Some Polymetric Songs in the Manuscript Torino J.II.9.” In *The Cypriot French Repertory of the Manuscript Torino J.II.9: Report of the International Musicological Congress, Paphos 20-25 March, 1992*, edited by Ursula Günther and Ludwig Finsher, 463-89. *Musicological Studies & Documents*, edited by Ursula Günther, 45. [Neuhausen and Stuttgart]: American Institute of Musicology, Hänssler-Verlag, 1995.
- . “Unusual Phenomena in the Transmission of Late Fourteenth-Century Polyphonic Music.” *Musica disciplina* 38 (1984): 87-118.
- . “Zitate in französischen Liedsätzen der *ars nova* und *ars subtilior*.” *Musica disciplina* 26 (1972): 53-68.
- . “Zur Biographie einiger Komponisten des *ars subtilior*.” *Archiv für Musikwissenschaft* 21 (1964): 172-99.
- . “Zur Datierung des Manuskripts Modena, Biblioteca Estense, &M. 5, 24 (*olim* lat. 568).” In *Bericht über den internationalen musikwissenschaftlichen Kongress Leipzig 1966*, 175-81. Basel, Tours, and London: Bärenreiter Kassel, [1970].

- . “Związki znaczeniowe między tekstem a muzyką *ars nova* i *ars subtilior*.” *Muzyka* 33, no. 2 (1988): 3-40.
- , ed. Introduction to *The Motets of the Manuscripts Chantilly, musée Condé, 564 (olim 1047) and Modena, Biblioteca Estense, & M. 5, 24 (olim lat. 568)*. *Corpus mensurabilis musicae* 39. n.p.: American Institute of Musicology, 1965.
- Haggh, Barbara. “Contemplating the Chantilly Codex.” *Early Music* 30 (May 2002): 264-69.
- Hirshberg, Jehoash. “The Music of the Late Fourteenth Century: A Study of Musical Style.” PhD diss., University of Pennsylvania, 1971.
- Hoppin, Richard H. “The Cypriot-French Repertory of the Manuscript Torino, Biblioteca Nazionale, J.II.9.” *Musica disciplina* 11 (1957): 79-125.
- . “Transition to the Renaissance.” In *Medieval Music, 470-501*. The Norton Introduction to Music History. New York: W.W. Norton & Company Inc., 1978.
- Josephson, Nors. “Intersectional Relationships in the French *Grande ballade*.” *Musica disciplina* 40 (1986): 79-97.
- . “Vier Beispiele der *ars subtilior*.” *Archiv für Musikwissenschaft* 27, no.1 (1970): 41-58.
- Koehler, Laurie. *Pythagoreish-platonische Proportionen in Werken der ars nova und ars subtilior*. 2 vols. Göttinger Musikwissenschaftliche Arbeiten 12. Kassel, Basel, London, and New York: Bärenreiter, 1990.
- . “*Subtilitas in musica*: A Re-examination of Johannes Olivier’s ‘Si con cy gist’.” *Musica disciplina* 36 (1982): 95-118.
- Kreitner, Kenneth. “The Catalan *ars subtilior*.” In *The Church Music of Fifteenth-Century Spain*, 12-28. *Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music* 2. Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2004.
- Kügler, Karl. “The Repertory of Torino J.II.9, and the French Tradition of the 14th and Early 15th Centuries.” In *The Cypriot French Repertory of the Manuscript Torino J.II.9: Report of the International Musicological Congress, Paphos 20-25 March, 1992*, edited by Ursula Günther and Ludwig Finsher, 151-81. *Musicological Studies & Documents*, edited by Ursula Günther, 45. [Neuhausen and Stuttgart]: American Institute of Musicology, Hänssler-Verlag, 1995.
- Leech-Wilkinson, Daniel. “*Ars antiqua—Ars nova—Ars subtilior*.” In *Antiquity and the Middle Ages: From Ancient Greece to the Fifteenth Century*, edited by James McKinnon, 218-40. *Music and Society*. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice Hall, [first North American edition 1991].

- . “Articulating *ars subtilior* Song.” *Early Music* 31 (February 2003): 6-20.
- Lefferts, Peter M. “*Subtilitas* in the Tonal Language of *Fumeux fume*.” *Early Music* 16 (May 1988): 176-83.
- Lipka, Krzysztof. “Pyton, zwyciezca Febusaa.” *Canor: Kwartalnik poświęcony problemom interpretacji muzyki dawnej*, 1 January 1994, 46-52.
- Long, Michael. “Musical Tastes in Fourteenth-Century Italy: Notational Styles, Scholarly Traditions, and Historical Circumstances.” PhD diss., Princeton University, 1981.
- Ludwig, Friedrich. “Geschichte der Mensuralnotation von 1250-1460, nach den theorichen und praktischen Quellen bearbeitet von Johannes Wolf.” *Sammelbände der internationalen Musikgesellschaft* 6 (1904-1905): 597-641.
- Magnan, Robert. “Eustache Deschamps and His Double: *Musique naturele* and *musique artificiele*.” *Ars Lyrica* 7 (1993): 47-64.
- Memelsdorff, Pedro. “‘Le grant désir’: Verschlüsselte Chromatik bei Matteo da Perugia.” In *Provokation und Tradition: Erfahrungen mit der Alten Musik*, 53-55. Stuttgart: Metzler, 2000.
- Mertl, Monika. “*Ars subtilior*.” *Die Buehne*, no. 373 (1989): 27-28.
- Meyer, Donald C. “The Special Note Shape of the *ars subtilior*.” Master’s thesis, University of California Davis, 1992.
- Miyazaki, Haruyo. “The Notation Treatise *tractatus figuratum*; A Notation Method Found in the Theory of *ars subtilior*.” In *Ongaku no uchu: Minagawa Tatsuo Sensei koki kinen ronbunshu*, 114-23. Tokyo: Ongaku no Tomosha, 1998.
- Mueller, Richard E. “The Rhythmic Style Found in Selected Ballades by the Major Composers of the Late Fourteenth-Century French School of ‘Mannered’ Notation.” Master’s thesis, Indiana University, 1970.
- Nevel, Paul van. *Polyfonie en ars subtilior*. Leuven: Uitgeverij de Monte, [1974].
- Newes, Virginia. “Imitation et canon dans *l’ars nova* et *l’ars subtilior*.” Mémoire de licence, Université libre de Bruxelles, 1976.
- . “Imitation in the *ars nova* and *ars subtilior*.” *Revue belge de musicologie* 31 (1977): 38-59.
- Parrish, Carl. “Special Notations of the Late Medieval Period.” In *The Notation of Medieval Music*, 183-95. New York: W.W. Norton & Company Inc., 1959.

- Pirrota, Nino. “‘Dulcedo’ e ‘subtilitas’ nelle pratica polifonica franco-italiana al principio del ‘400.’” *Revue belge de musicologie* 2 (July-October 1948): 125-32.
- . *Musica tra medioevo e rinascimento*. Torino: Giulio Einaudi Editore, 1984.
- Plumley, Yolanda. “Citation and Allusion in the Late *ars nova*: The Case of *Esperance* and the *En attendant* Songs.” *Early Music History* 18 (1999): 287-363.
- . “An “Episode of the South”? *Ars subtilior* and the Patronage of French Princes.” *Early Music History* 22 (2003): 103-68.
- . “Form and Process in the *ars subtilior*.” In *The Grammar of 14th Century Melody: Tonal Organization and Compositional Process in the Chansons of Guillaume de Machaut and the ars subtilior*, 237-99. Outstanding Dissertations in Music from British Universities, edited by John Caldwell. New York and London: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1996.
- . “Intertextuality in the Fourteenth-Century Chanson.” *Music and Letters* 84 (August 2003): 355-77.
- . “Playing the Citation Game in the Late 14th-Century Chanson.” *Early Music* 31 (February 2003): 20-40.
- Reaney, Gilbert. “A Poscript to ‘The Manuscript Chantilly, Musée Condé 1047.’” *Musica disciplina* 10 (1956): 55-59.
- . “The Manuscript Chantilly, Musée Condé 1047.” *Musica disciplina* 8 (1954): 59-113.
- Rosa-Barezzani, Maria T. “The Notation of the Manuscript Torino J.II.9: A Journey through Rhythmic Problems and Melodic Fragments.” In *The Cypriot French Repertory of the Manuscript Torino J.II.9: Report of the International Musicological Congress, Paphos 20-25 March, 1992*, edited by Ursula Günther and Ludwig Finsher, 117-49. *Musicological Studies & Documents*, edited by Ursula Günther, 45. [Neuhausen and Stuttgart]: American Institute of Musicology, Hänssler-Verlag, 1995.
- Schreur, Philip Evan. “The *tractatus figuratum: Subtilitas* in the Notation of the Late Fourteenth Century.” PhD diss., Stanford University, 1987.
- . *Tractatus figurarum: Treatise on Noteshapes*. Greek and Latin Music Theory, edited by Thomas J. Mathiesen. Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press, 1989.
- Simard, Andrée G. “The Manuscript Torino J.II.9: A Late Medieval Perspective on Musical Life and Culture at the Court of the Lusignan Kings at Nicosia.” Master’s thesis, University of Akron, 2005.

- Strohm, Reinhard. "Filippotto da Caserta, ovvero I francesi in Lombardia." In *In cantu et in sermone: for Nino Pirrotta on his 80th birthday*, edited by France Piperno and Fabrizio Della Seta, 65-74. Italian Medieval and Renaissance Studies 2. Firenze: Leo S. Olschki, [1989].
- . *The Rise of European Music, 1380-1500*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.
Contains multiple references to the *ars subtilior* throughout.
- Stone, Anne. "The *ars subtilior* in Paris." *Musica e storia* 10, no. 2 (2002): 373-404.
- . "Che cosa c'è di più sottile riguardo l'*ars subtilior*?" *Rivista italiana di musicologia* 31, no.1 (1996): 3-31.
- . "Glimpses of the Unwritten Tradition in Some *ars subtilior* Works." *Musica disciplina* 50 (1996): 59-93.
- . "Self-reflexive Songs and Their Readers in the Late 14th Century." *Early Music* 31 (May 2003): 180-95.
- . "A Singer at the Fountain: Homage and Irony in Ciconia's 'Sus une fontayne'." *Music and Letters* 82 (August 2001): 361-90.
- . "Writing Rhythm in the Late Medieval Italy: Notation and Musical Style in the Manuscript Modena, Biblioteca Estense, Alpha.M.5.24." PhD diss., Harvard University, 1994.
- Tanay, Dorit. "*Ars subtilior*." In *Noting Music, Marking Culture: The Intellectual Context of Rhythmic Notation, 1250-1400*, edited by Ursula Günther, 185-245. Musicological Studies and Documents, edited by Ursula Günther, 46. [Holzgerlingen]: American Institute of Musicology; Hänssler-Verlag, 1999.
- . "Music in the Age of Ockham: The Interrelationship between Music, Mathematics, and Philosophy in the Fourteenth Century." PhD diss., University of California, Berkeley, 1989.
- Taruskin, Richard. "Machaut and His Progeny." In *The Earliest Notations to the Sixteenth Century*. Vol. 1 of *The Oxford History of Western Music*. [Oxford and New York]: Oxford University Press, 2005.
- Upon, Elizabeth Randell. "The Chantilly Codex ("F-CH" 564): The Manuscript, Its Music, Its Scholarly Reception." PhD diss., University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, 2001.
- Vermeulen, Ernst. "Klinkende wetenschap—het experiment (2): *ars subtilior*." *Mens en Melodie* 51 (February 1996): 87-91.

Vivarelli, Carla. “‘*Ars cantus mensurabilis mensurata per modos iuris*’ un trattato napoletano di *ars subtilior*?” In *L’ars nova italiana del Trecento VII: “Dolci nuove note”, atti del quinto convegno internazionale in ricordo di federico Ghisi (1901-1975) (Certaldo, 17-18 dicembre 2005)*, edited by Francesco Zimei, 103-42. Centro studi sull’ars nova italiana del Trecento. [Lucca]: Libreria Musicale Italiana, [2009].

———. “L’evoluzione del pensiero musicale tra trecento e quattrocento. Uno studio comparato di teoria e prassi *subtilior*.” Tesi di dottorato in musicologia e scienze filologiche, Università degli studi di Pavia, 2006.

Von Ficker, Rudolf. “The Transition on the Continent.” In *Ars nova and Renaissance 1300-1540*. Vol. 3 of *The New Oxford History of Music*. London, New York, and Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1960.

Williams, Carol. “Two Examples of Mannerist Notation in the Late Fourteenth Century.” *Miscellanea Musicologia: Adelaide Studies in Musicology*, edited by Andrew D. McCredie, 111-28. Adelaide: Libraries Board of South Australia, 1980.

Wolf, Johannes. *Geschichte der Mensural-Notation von 1250-1460*. Geschichtliche Darstellungen. Hildesheim and Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1965.

Contains references to the *ars subtilior* throughout.

Unverified sources

Clercx, Suzanne. “Johannes Ciconia, théoricien.” In *Société de musique d’autrefois*, 3:39-75. Neuilly-sur-Seine: Annales de musicologie, 1955.

———. *Johannes Ciconia: un musicien liégeois et son temps (vers 1335-1411)*. 2 vols. Académie royale des sciences, des lettres et des beaux arts. Bruxelles: Palais des Académies, 1960.

Dobrzanska-Fabianska, Zofia. *Izorytmiczna koncepcja dzieła muzycznego : epoka Notre Dame, ars antiqua - ars nova - ars subtilior, epoka burgundzka*. Kraków: Polskie Wydawnictwo Muzyczne, 1988.

Earp, Lawrence M. “*Ars subtilior*.” In *Medieval France: An Encyclopedia*. Garland Encyclopedias of the Middle Ages 2. New York: Garland Publisher, 1995.

Green, Gordon K. “The Secular Music of *Chantilly* Manuscript, Musée Condé 564 (*olim* 1047).” PhD diss., Indiana University, 1971.

Plumley, Yolanda. “Style and Structure in the Late 14th-Century Chanson.” PhD diss., University of Exeter, 1991.

Stoessel, Jason. "The Captive Scribe: The Context and Culture of Scribal and Notational Process of the *ars subtilior*." PhD diss., University of New England, 2002.

Sultan, Agathe. "La harpe et la forge: Poétique de l'*ars subtilior*." In "*De vrai humain entendements*": *Etudes sur la littérature française de la fin de Moyen-Age offertes en hommage à Jacqueline Cerquiglini-Toulet le 24 janvier 2003*, edited by Yasmina Foehr-Janssens and Jean-Yves Tilliette, 163+. *Recherches et rencontres* 21. Genève: Librairies Droz, 2005.

Tanay, Dorit, and Raz Chen Morriz. "Music, Mathematics, and the Rejection of Pansemiotism in the Renaissance." In *Music and Mathematics in the Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe*, 71-96. Turnhout: Brepols, 2008.